

# Day 17, 21.03.2019 Cosmology 3

1

7 days until opening day

Joe Bonamassa week

2

# housekeeping



Gotta come to class

question about <u>anything</u>?

I'll make a movie for you:

Grades to date: Projects, quizzes, notes in a pdf in the slides area

the rest of your grades are in LON-CAPA or MasteringPhysics

### Section 2 folks:

Project has begun in phases:

Document 1: software, introduction, tutorial: due March 22

Document 2: your individual dataset and project instructions: due Final Exam

https://qstbb.pa.msu.edu/storage/QS&BB2019/Homework\_Projects/ honors\_project\_2019/Minervalnstructions1\_2019.pages.pdf

MasteringAstronomy:

Course ID: MABROCK41459;

free code: WSSPCT-BLIDA-INANE-TOGUE-RIGOT-UNRWA

I configured it wrong. I've extended the due date to Sunday.



## March 2019



Eastern Time Time Zone





## There are a handful of "classic tests"





6

in 1915 scientific cosmology didn't exist

does now.

## in 1917 the universe presumed by all to be:

- static, eternal
- limited to the Milky Way that's it.

cozy.



# Einstein

# began the first truly scientific field of cosmology applying GR (1915) to the entire universe

1917: Cosmological Considerations in the General Theory of Relativity

"It exposes me to the danger of being confined to a madhouse."

# need a starting point & assumptions

in order to be able to solve the GR equations

Einstein enunciated the "Cosmological Principle"

On the largest scale:

the universe is homogeneous

the universe is isotropic

the universe looks the same to all

### the average density of matter is about the same and uniform at all places in the Universe: there are no special places

# observers: there are no special directions

quantitative cosmology

## rests on the Cosmological Principle



It doesn't matter where you are.

Viewed on sufficiently large distance scales, there are no preferred directions nor are there preferred places in the Universe.

The Universe is presumed to be **homogeneous:** average density same & uniform everywhere and **isotropic**: no special directions

my Famous Probable Planar Pepperoni Pizza Probe

...as viewed from the center:



not isotropic and yet homogeneous



not homogeneous and yet isotropic



homogeneous and isotropic

homogenous?

the only way to calculate!

smear all of the stars (nebulae out) into a dust, or fluid

density, not individual masses, is the meaningful quantity

How good is that approximation? The current density of matter in the universe is about 6 protons/m<sup>3</sup>

# He was plagued by infinity

He ran into a similar problem that Newton did...

The weird delicate balance of an infinite universe...with an infinite gravitational force on all objects

strangely in balance!

Major conclusion: The universe must be infinite and static.

But he was smarter than Newton

And he owned a tool to erase infinity!

Make use of his geometric-tool and assume enough mass in the whole Universe *to cause space to bend around on itself...* 

NO



### an edge to the universe was Newton's worry

### That was his goal: to get rid of infinity



A mathematical fact: These 3 are the only geometries that can be both homogeneous and isotropic

## is impossible to visualize the negative curvature 3d shape... it's like a saddle, or mmm Pringles Potato HyperChips

# uh oh

## this wasn't going well

What to do? GR appeared to be right...the Classic Tests!

He mucked with his beloved equation.

# the dreaded

... if it were certain that the field equations which I have hitherto employed were the only ones compatible with the postulate of general relativity, we should probably have to conclude that the theory of relativity does not admit the hypothesis of a spatially finite universe.

However, the system of equations allows a readily suggested extension which is compatible with the relativity postulate ...

## Cosmological Constant, A

"... the introduction of this second member constitutes a complication of the theory, which seriously reduces its logical simplicity."

geometry

$$G = T$$

he added a **negative pressure** term...

$$G + \Lambda = T$$

a **negative pressure**-like term...that only is relevant on huge scales the "Cosmological Constant"

Makes the Universe static...not expanding or contracting

later: "My biggest blunder."

for 2 reasons: Hubble and instability



energy, pressure, mass

He believes his to be the only possible solutions to G = Tor  $G + \Lambda = T$ 

# Wrong

### $G + \Lambda = T = 0$ (no matter density)

## about the uniqueness of his solution

## Willem de Sitter







### strictly geometry...so, what's the matter?

Now wait a minute... **NO MATTER** in de Sitter's model, empty universe!

Geometry of spacetime - by itself - actually causes spacetime to bend!! Einstein presumed only matter could do that.

Einstein took it badly...even though colleagues and friends, he was very critical of de Sitter in print



static.

18

### remember the rope and knife?

The Prevailing Wisdom...matter in the Universe accounts for universally accelerated motion.

Einstein fervently believed that...named the idea "Mach's Principle" after his hero in Prague.

### another thought-experiment

How can you tell if you are accelerating, ie rotating?

cut the rope: if you fly away from the mass, you're accelerating (wrt Absolute Space). If not, you aren't - said Newton.

Why? Because of your inertia - what gives you that?

Along comes



with a Universe-solution that has NO MATTER, but gravity, nonetheless.



### Absolute Space, said Newton

### Einstein was convinced that only MATTER could warp spacetime!

but as Feynman's advisor said many years later:

Alexander Friedman (1888 -1925)

in 1922, 23

finds a whole class of solutions!

with and without  $\Lambda$ 



Pandora's Box.

Now, the modern basis of GR solutions: the "Friedman Solutions"

29 June 1922, submits paper "On the curvature of Space" to to Zeitschrift für Physik

Einstein didn't take it well.

## Adding insult to injury, an unknown mathematical meteorologist from Russia opened The General Relativity

# G = T $G + \Lambda = T$

# The results concerning the nonstationary world, contained in [this] work, appear to me suspicious. In reality, it turns out that the solution given in it does not satisfy the [general

relativity] equations.

Einstein in a letter of complaint to the premier journal considering publication of Friedman's work

18 September 1922 Zeitschrift für Physik

Considering that the possible existence of a non-stationary world has a certain interest, I will allow myself to present to you here the calculations I have made ... for verification and critical assessment. [The calculations are given] ... Should you find the calculations presented in my letter correct, please be so kind as to inform the editors of the Zeitschrift für Physik about it; perhaps in this case you will publish a correction to your statement or provide an opportunity for a portion of this letter to be published.

Friedman to Einstein, 6 December 1922

# 

In my previous note I criticised [Friedman's work On the curvature of Space]. However, my criticism, as I became convinced by Friedman's letter communicated to me ..., was based on an error in my calculations. I consider that Mr Friedmann's results are correct and shed new light.

May 1923 Einstein capitulating later in a letter to Zeitschrift fur Physik

# To punish me for my contempt for authority, Fate made me an authority myself.

Einstein in typical bumper-sticker mode. *mea culpa* 

## Friedman then traveled Europe promoting his work

In July 1925 took a record-breaking 7.4km balloon flight with meteorological instruments

By the end of August he was dead of Typhoid Fever... badly, deliriously lecturing to an imaginary classroom while separated from his pregnant wife.

"Edwin Hubble, I have watched for four years and I have never seen you study for ten minutes." He then paused for what was an awful moment for Edwin, and continued, "Here is a scholarship to the University of Chicago."

Wheaton, Illinois HS Principal to Edwin Hubble at his 1906 graduation

# Edwin Hubble 1889-1953

astronomer

discoverer of:

the whole universe

the expanding universe







very systematic thinker/ writer

1922-1926:

Hubble classification scheme for "nebulae"



basically: spherical, elliptical, bar, and irregular

# remember HR diagram

## "instability" strip



distances are hard to determine

Cepheid Variable stars: the clue to galactic distances

absolute brightness is related to their period

since brightness goes like 1/R<sup>2</sup> -> distance!

bootstrapping











### discovered by Henrietta Leavitt at Harvard

## Knowing the absolute amount of light from an object

can calculate the distance

Cepheid Variable Stars are a yardstick

Hubble used Leavitt's formulation

Cepheids were everywhere!

were "nebulae" in the Milky Way?

or, is the universe much bigger?



M31, Andromeda 2900 thousand light years



M33, Triangulum 3000 thousand light years

ended.

## The universe became HUGE... overnight!



### 1924: Andromeda is its own galaxy

### That famous public argument



- NGC 6822, Barnard's Galaxy
- 1700 thousand light years

# But wait. There's more.

Hubble was just warming up.

# atomic spectra

## unique fingerprint of the atomic species





http://www.ruf.rice.edu/~mcannon/Research%20Home/Research%20Home.htm

# stars are colorful



## line spectra

### label stars' outer chemistries





RA=147.09176, DEC=-0.07735, MJD=51630, Plate= 266, Fiber= 32
# Hubble used

the finger-print tool of spectroscopy

plus

the distance determination tool of Cepheid Variables

# His results:

### Wavelengths shifted to longer -"redshifted"

meaning all of his galaxies seemed to be moving away from us

eg, seemingly, Doppler shifts at work:



http://www.astro.ucla.edu/~wright/doppler.htm



# it seemed like





# called the "Doppler Effect"



you've all had the experience of listening to the sound of a moving object change pitch



Source moving to Right, shorter wavelengths @R: pitch goes up for R.

Sound moving away from L...pitch goes down for L. Lower pitch, longer wavelengths..."red-ish" if light. 39

the motion toward the left means that R is seeing more peaks in a given time than L, shorter wavelengths @R: pitch goes up for R

Doppler Effect

change of pitch when source of sound

moves towards you

or away from you





## v - speed of sound in air e - emitted o-observed

 $=\frac{\lambda_O-\lambda_e}{\lambda_e}$ 

### **Observed wavelengths**

C

<----- Lab wavelengths

### "away from us" red shifted

40



## but Hubble assumed that it was

# remember the Gravitational Red Shift?





# well, this is not that either!

# he put two things together

the spectra —> speed

the distance





## H: a measure of the time a galaxy has been "traveling"

# It's a little tricky... Think Balloons.





= rH



# HUBBLE'S CONSTANT = 1/T

FROM LEAVITT'S CEPHEID VARIABLE RELATION





Time 1

46

# ball





### Time 3

 $4d_{0}$ 







keep track of how far away everything is from Galaxy A





### Going to calculate the speed at which **B and C** recede from **A** in Time 1-2 and Time 2-3



Time 1



distance, time 1	<i>r</i> = (A to B)= <i>d</i> <sub>0</sub>	$r = (A \text{ to } C) = 2d_0$
time 2, ∆t later… distance, doubled	<i>r</i> = 2 <i>d</i> <sub>0</sub>	$r = 4d_0$
$\Delta r$ , the difference:	$\Delta r$ (A to B)	$\Delta r$ (A to C)
$\Delta r \text{ between} \\ time 1 \text{ and } 2 \neq \Delta t$	$\Delta r = 2d_0 - d_0 = d_0$	
speed $v = \frac{\Delta r}{\Delta t}$	$d_0/\Delta t = v_0$	



pl	ot	'en	l up	$5v_0$ slo
		(betw	${\cal U}$ veen A and)	$ \begin{array}{c} 4v_{0} \\ 3v_{0} \\ 2v_{0} \\ v_{0} \end{array} $ B
distance, time 1	$r = (A \text{ to } B) = d_0$	$r = (A \text{ to } C) = 2d_0$	$r = (A \text{ to } D) = 3d_0$	
distance, time 2	$r = 2d_0$	$r = 4d_0$	r = 6d0	$(2d_0)^2$
difference:	$\Delta r$ (A to B)	$\Delta r$ (A to C)	$\Delta r$ (A to D)	
$\Delta r$ between time 1 and 2 = $\Delta t$	$\Delta r = 2d_0 - d_0 = d_0$	$\Delta r = 4d_0 - 2d_0 = 2d_0$	$\Delta r = 6d_0 - 3d_0 = 3d_0$	v = (slope)
speed	$d_0/\Delta t = v_0$	$2d_0/\Delta t = 2v_0$	$3d_0/\Delta t = 3v_0$	
				suppose

Also: look at the dimensions of that slope



ope =  $2v_0/4d_0 = v_0/2d_0$ 





 $r = \left(\frac{v_0}{2d_0}\right)r$ 

suppose  $r = 5 d_0$ ?

what's v? 2.5  $v_0$ 

 $\left(\frac{v_0}{2d_0}\right)$ :  $\frac{\text{velocity}}{\text{distance}} \sim \frac{\text{m/s}}{\text{m}} \sim \frac{1}{\text{time}}$ 

# Hubble's Law

a profound discovery about the Universe

v = rH

52

### relation alert:

### Hubble's Law v = rHrefers to:

example:

Speed of a galaxy is proportional to the

distance away from any point. galaxy NGC1832 is 9.57 x 10<sup>20</sup> km away, so Hubble's Law says it would be moving at v = 2150 km/s

# **original results:** 1 light year = $c \times 1$ year = $9.5 \times 10^{15}$ m



# So, what does Hubble's Law mean?

apart from the balloon...

v = rH



Georges Lemaître (1894-1966)

## Father of the Big Bang

I crack myself up.





# three kinds of education

war seminary physics





http://www.flickr.com/photos/miguelcalleja/sets/72157604962600986/detail/

# 1927

## Lemaître's model

published obscurely

he believed that **General Relativity** required an expanding universe



"Your math is correct, but your physics is abominable."

### again, Einstein behaved badly

# Again, Einstein lets his prejudices

get the better of him

he'd pay for that

# In 1927 he published a solution

"A homogeneous Universe of constant mass and growing radius accounting for the radial velocity of extragalactic nebulae"

Solving G = T....with spacetime geometry set free

in an obscure Belgian journal

He predicted the H constant!



60



his model required the Universe to be explicitly expanding

When Hubble's results were announced

he showed it to his old advisor, Sir Arthur Eddington who made it public in 1930:

The Lemaître-Eddington model:

constant size, with Einstein's value...and expands from there...



### "brilliant"

## Lemaître was the first to realize that Hubble had demonstrated:

1. spacetime is stretching

The entire kit and caboodle is expanding





Here's what it does NOT mean:

galaxies are not "moving away" inside of the universe





# what stretching DOES mean

## is complicated!

### universe



# what stretching DOES mean

## is complicated!



### universe



## Lemaître was the first to realize that Hubble had demonstrated:

- 1. spacetime is stretching
- The entire kit and caboodle is expanding



2. But then he realized that the current Universe could have come from something smaller





# think about the ballood coming from a smaller size

and still smaller and still smaller

until.







r (from A)

We can compare space-time to an open, conic cup... The bottom of the cup is the origin of atomic disintegration; it is the first instant at the bottom of space-time, the now which has no yesterday because, yesterday, there was no space.

George Lemaitre, The Primeval Atom, 1946

# Lemaître envisioned

A "primeval atom"

it was the heady times of quantum mechanics and early nuclear physics

He envisioned a fissioning of a big, big nucleus



# think about this.

a Catholic Priest-Theoretical Physicist

envisioning the beginning of the Universe...a "creation story"?
Sir Arthur Eddington states that, philosophically, the notion of the beginning of the present order of Nature is repugnant... I would rather be inclined to think that the present state of quantum theory suggests a beginning of the world very different from the present order of Nature.

[[

### Lemaître: Nature comment May 9, 1931

### Was his theology in the way of his science?

No.

He was explicit in his separation of the science and his faith And, the respect that his colleagues held for him did not result in accusations of him pushing his religion into Cosmology

### undercut

Lemaître had been very careful

to not mix religion and science

Imagine his panic

when 1951 "Study Week" the Pious XIII made a statement:





. . . contemporary science, with one sweep back across the centuries, has succeeded in bearing witness to the august instant of the primordial Fiat Lux, which along with the matter there burst forth from nothing a sea of light and radiation . . . Thus, with that concreteness which is characteristic of physical proofs, modern science has confirmed the contingency of the universe and also the vvell-founded deduction to the epoch when the world came forth from the hands of the creator.

ALLA LUCE DELLA SCIENZA NATURALE MODERNA\*, 1951

**\*TESTS OF THE EXISTENCE OF GOD** IN THE LIGHT OF MODERN NATURAL SCIENCE



## Pius XIII, LE PROVE DELLA ESISTENZA DI DIO

## Whoa. Lemaître was stunned.

Science and religion to him: two completely different paths

As far as I can see, such a theory remains entirely outside any metaphysical or religious question. It leaves the materialist free to deny any transcendent Being. 1

We may speak of this event as of a beginning. I do not say a creation.

Physically it is a beginning in the sense that if something happened before, it has no observable influence on the behavior of our universe, as any feature of matter before this beginning has been completely lost by the extreme contraction at the theoretical zero.

Any preexistence of the universe has a metaphysical character. Physically, everything happens as if the theoretical zero was really a beginning. The question if it was really a beginning or rather a creation, something started from nothing, is a philosophical question which cannot be settled by physical or astronomical considerations.



Solvay Conference 1958



quoted in: Godart and Heller, Cosmology of Lemaître, 67



# WWII was hard on Belgium

after the war, Lemaître did not go back to first-principle cosmology

but he pioneered scientific computing on cosmological parameters before anyone in the 1950's

### Like Copernicus

Within days of his death, Lemaître learned of Penzias and Wilson's discovery of the cosmic microwave background

consistent with the Big Bang

June 20, 1966

## Hubble Constant

critical measurable parameter in cosmology

# speed and distance!



d = 300 min = 0 = 60 mph how long? -- what's t ?

t=0

t=tN





# original results:



1 megaparsec (Mpc) =  $10^{6}$  parsec =  $3.26 \times 10^{6}$  light years =  $3.086 \times 10^{16}$  m

### so 1/H measures the age of the universe\*

 $H_{0}$  the do?.  $H = \frac{160 \text{ m/s}}{\text{Mky}}$  1929  $1 \text{H}_{2} = 9.5 \times 10^{15} \text{m}.$ 





# a big "uh oh"

almost immediately after Hubble's measurement

### oops.

geologists already understood that the Earth was at least 3 By old.

That required some work!

Refinements found a number of assumptions in need of updating

for example...there are 2 kinds of Cepheid Variable stars, and other issues

### This is the beginning of quantitative Cosmology.

Measuring the Hubble Constant is an important cottage industry in astronomy

current best result:

 $H_0 = 67.66 \pm 0.42 \text{ km/sec/Mpc}$ 

 $H_0 = 2.2 \times 10^{-18} \text{ s}^{-1} = 4.5 \times 10^{17} \text{ s} = 14.5 \text{ By}^*$ 

The subscript "0" means: "Now"

\* first-pass: The inverse of the Hubble Constant isn't necessarily the age of the universe

1 megaparsec (Mpc) =  $10^6$  parsec =  $3.26 \times 10^6$  light years =  $3.086 \times 10^{16}$  m



### what do the red shift(S) actually imply? & what was Lemaître's insight?

not doppler

not gravitational

here's what it is.



## the "red shift"



### isn't a Doppler velocity

it's geometry









### The further away



the more red-shifted its spectrum will be

and the faster it will appear to be receding

the older it will be

and the younger it will appear to be!

## here's how this is described

a little technical, but you can do it!



# Then a spiritual moment occurs. involving spandex.

fabric of 🕁 spacetime

🖲 🔍 🛞 fabric 🗄 Shop   Joani	n.com 🗙 🔼			
🗄 🔿 C 🔒 🕲 www.joanr	n.com/fabric/			
Instaper W WorkFlowy-Kim	🚞 PAC 🛛 📄 stretc	h	DPF	QS&BBlinks 📋
JO <sub>2</sub>	ANN d craft stores	DESIGN YO	UR DECOR	shopping
fabric	sewing & quilt	scrapbooking   cr	afts   yarn &	cross stitch   ba
Lea	p Day S	Sale! 2	29¢ Fl	at-Rat
	Ho	ome > Fabric		
Shop by Ca	tegory			
New Arrivals				-
Editor's Picks	;	50%		
Fashion Tren	ds	JU		
Apparel Fabri	ic	Quilter's		41
Babyville		Showcase	10h	4
Batting		Prints		
Bulk Fabric			5	
Fiberfill & Pille	owforms			All and
Flannel Fabric	c			
Fleece Fabric		10 million		
Holiday Fabri	c		annut.	
Interfacing			777	
				ALL
Licensed Fab	ric			

Home Decor Fabric

Home Decor Trims Home Decor Notions Drapery Hardware Quilting Fabric & Kits Spacetime Fabrics

Team Shop

Utility Fabrics

Fabric Clearance Shop by Brand

Shop by Color

Best Sellers Clearance New Products

Online Exclusive Top Rated

On Sale

More Ways To Shop

Available In Select Stores

Trims

Vinyl

Home Decor Memo Swatches

















### So, we need 4 deities:



dark specter from power rangers from space





**Arceus from Pokémon** 

### lord firth watership down



fujin from Mortal Kombat

# What's R(t)?

### The "scale factor"

the stretchiness of spacetime

96

### The Friedman, Walker, Robertson models

Friedman's and Lemaître's work was expanded on by Howard P Robertson and Arthur G Walker in 1936

They found exact solutions to the Einstein equations, using the Friedman techniques.

Their model of cosmology is variously called the:

FWR model

**FLWR** model

**Standard Model of Cosmology** 



## can catalogue the behavior of R.

for different choices of the Cosmological Constant and k



What did Einstein say would be the case?

*r*, t = 0



Static...for which he needed a particular value of the Cosmological Constant

R(t)



time

